

Regarding: A Proposed Rule by the Food and Drug Administration on 05/01/2015.

Safety and Effectiveness of Health Care Antiseptics; Topical Antimicrobial Drug Products for Over-the-Counter Human Use; Proposed Amendment of the Tentative Final Monograph; Reopening of Administrative Record.

To whom it may concern:

We are writing this comment to address concerns we have with regard to the proposed FDA “rule to address data gaps for certain active ingredients in health care antiseptics”.

We would like to strongly recommend the inclusion of Chlorhexidine in this initiative. Chlorhexidine is undergoing a rapidly expanding role in the prevention of hospital acquired infections. Many researchers are advocating the use of chlorhexidine every day on every patient in the ICU.

However, we feel both the safety and efficacy of chlorhexidine has not been substantiated. There are significant concerns regarding the developing of antibiotic resistance and the long term effects of expanded chlorhexidine usage on the patient’s and facility’s microbiome.(1-3)

Several researchers have found evidence of developing resistance to chlorhexidine. Suwantarat N, et al.(4) reported that patients who were bathed daily with chlorhexidine were more likely to develop CLABSIs with reduced susceptibility to chlorhexidine and Lee AS, et al found that chlorhexidine resistance independently predicted failure in MRSA decolonization.(5) It has also been asserted that usage of chlorhexidine may have been one of the driving initiators for the emergence of the extremely-drug-resistant epidemic strain of *Klebsiella pneumonia*.(6)

In addition, there are also significant concerns regarding industry influence and research integrity of Chlorhexidine.(1-3,7) For example, such issues were behind a 40 million dollar U.S. Dept. of Justice Settlement with CareFusion.(7) Other authors have found significant problems related to overstating the findings and the change of metrics after study initiation.(1-3) There have been at least four articles which have compared chlorhexidine plus alcohol to another antiseptic but attributed the increase in efficacy to chlorhexidine alone.(3)

This proposal’s FDA press release references the advisory committee meeting on Sept. 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2014 (in Silver Springs) and states that this initiative is designed to address concerns brought up at the meeting: <http://www.fda.gov/AdvisoryCommittees/Calendar/ucm407136.htm>

It should be noted that our concerns regarding the greatly expanded role and use of Chlorhexidine were also presented at a Sept. 5<sup>th</sup>, 2014 FDA advisory meeting in Silver Springs.(8) The decision to only address concerns on antiseptics, which were expressed on Sept. 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2014, and not address the comments expressed on Sept. 5<sup>th</sup>, 2014, seems arbitrary. Concerns at both meetings should be addressed.

The proposed FDA initiative will only evaluate antiseptics that were marketed before 1972, which excludes Chlorhexidine simply because it was first marketed after that year. The selection of this date also seems too restrictive, for it is the newer antiseptics which are being used for expanded indications

that have not been as time tested. These are the antiseptics which are in the most need of additional safety and efficacy data.

We therefore recommend that Chlorhexidine be included in the FDA's proposed regulation calling for more complete safety and effectiveness data on antiseptics.

Thank you for this consideration,

Kevin T. Kavanagh, MD, MS



Health Watch USA

Lexington, KY 40509

[healthwatchusa@gmail.com](mailto:healthwatchusa@gmail.com)

Lisa McGiffert

Consumers Union Safe Patient Project [project.org](http://project.org)

Austin, TX 78752

[www.safepatientproject.org](http://www.safepatientproject.org)

Jean Rexford

CT Center for Patient Safety

Fairfield, CT 06824

[www.http://ctcps.org](http://www.ctcps.org)

Kathy Day, RN

McCleary MRSA Prevention

Bangor, Maine

John T. James, PhD.

Patient Safety America

Houston, TX

Patty J Skolnik

Founder & Director

Citizens for Patient Safety

Denver, CO 80230

Julia Hallisy, DDS

The Empowered Patient Coalition

San Francisco, CA 94132

Rex Johnson and Yanling Yu, PhD

Washington Advocates for Patient Safety

Seattle, WA 98155

Kerry O'Connell  
Patient Advocate  
Denver, CO 80238

Lenore Alexander  
Executive Director, LeahLegacy  
Oak Park CA 91377

Al Levine  
Retired Office of Inspector General Senior Program Analyst  
Washington, DC

Helen Haskell, MA  
Mothers Against Medical Error  
Columbia, SC 29205

Suzan Shinazy, RN  
Patient Advocate, California

Joleen Chambers  
FAILED Implant Device Alliance  
Dallas, TX 75201

## References:

- 1) Kavanagh KT, Saman DM, Yu Y. Reply to "Planned Analyses of the REDUCE MRSA Trial". *Antimicrob Agents Chemother*. 2014 Apr;58(4):2486-7. doi: 10.1128/AAC.02821-13. PMID: 24643844 [http://www.healthwatchusa.org/HWUSA-Publications/PDF-Downloads/20140318-Antimicrob\\_Agents\\_Chemother-2014-Kavanagh-2486-7.pdf](http://www.healthwatchusa.org/HWUSA-Publications/PDF-Downloads/20140318-Antimicrob_Agents_Chemother-2014-Kavanagh-2486-7.pdf)
- 2) Kavanagh KT, Calderon LE and Saman DM Viewpoint: a response to "Screening and isolation to control methicillin-resistant *Staphylococcus aureus*: sense, nonsense, and evidence" *Antimicrobial Resistance and Infection Control* 2015, 4:4 (5 February 2015) <http://www.aricjournal.com/content/4/1/4>
- 3) Maiwald M, Chan ES. Pitfalls in evidence assessment: the case of chlorhexidine and alcohol in skin antisepsis. *J Antimicrob Chemother*. 2014 Aug;69(8):2017-21. doi: 10.1093/jac/dku121. Epub 2014 Apr 28. PMID: 24777898
- 4) Suwantararat N, Carroll KC, Tekle T, et al. High prevalence of reduced chlorhexidine susceptibility in organisms causing central line-associated bloodstream infections. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol*. 2014; **35**(9):1183-6.
- 5) Lee AS, Macedo-Vinas M, François P, et al. Impact of combined low-level mupirocin and genotypic chlorhexidine resistance on persistent methicillin-resistant *Staphylococcus aureus*

carriage after decolonization therapy: a case-control study. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2011; **52**(12):1422-30.

- 6) Naparstek L, Carmeli Y, Chmelnitsky I, Banin E, Navon-Venezia S. Reduced susceptibility to chlorhexidine among extremely-drug-resistant strains of *Klebsiella pneumoniae*. *J Hosp Infect*. 2012 May;81(1):15-9. doi: 10.1016/j.jhin.2012.02.007. Epub 2012 Mar 30. PMID: 22463977  
<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/22463977>
- 7) Department of Justice. Office of Public Affairs. CareFusion to Pay the Government \$40.1 Million to Resolve Allegations That Include More Than \$11 Million in Kickbacks to One Doctor. <http://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/carefusion-pay-government-401-million-resolve-allegations-include-more-11-million-kickbacks>
- 8) Public workshop. Clinical development of drugs for the prevention of infections caused by *staphylococcus aureus* in the health care setting. FDA Staph Workshop. Food and Drug Administration. Silver Springs, MD. Sept 5, 2014.  
<http://www.fda.gov/downloads/Drugs/NewsEvents/UCM416259.pdf>  
<http://www.fda.gov/Drugs/NewsEvents/ucm407259.htm>